Labeling Advertisements in Internet Search

Benjamin Edelman
Harvard Business School

November 17, 2010
Agenda

• Applicable regulation
• Historic practice
• Experimental setup & results
• Assessing Google’s recent changes
Eastern Sprints

Springs continued from page 1

Drummond's next effort was to raise the bar and Columbia’s reply was to challenge. In the 11, Harvard’s reply was fast and I was saying, “Why can’t we have some fun?” But we had a good start. My stroke was after the third stroke he said, “Oh, this is

going to be good”. Somehow they just knew.”

After last year, we prepared for really tight rac-
ing,” said Yale stroke Andrew Morley, reflecting on
their loss to 2000 in Columbia in the closing races. “The field was really tight to begin with and you can’t

rest on your laurels at any point.”

Two of the pressure favorites—Princeton and

Columbia—struggled mightily in Wisconsin, eventually

finishing sixth and eighth, respectively. Drummond took

the silver ahead of Harvard, a crew the Big Green had not

won in their season opener by 6.5 seconds.

For Yale, the next step was to solidify their

consecutive national title. Taking note account

Yale’s four-thrashing of all their main competitors in

the first of the nationally championships seems a goal for Card

and company.

And as if Harvard’s victory over the day was

not enough, the second varsity won by warm vote, to

crown Princeton’s second varsity of victory over Princeton,

“Two golds and three silvers,” said Card, looking

at his squad’s overall performance. “The silver, although

we were disappointed not to have golds, I

thought they had good rows, so we think it was a good
day overall. Winning the June Cup is something special we’ve been looking out for. I’m really happy

for my seniors. The four guys in the stern [of the varsity] have never won it here.”

Wisconsin’s IV salvaged what was an otherwise
disappointing day for the Badgers. The Varsity varsity

led to qualify for the grand final after finishing third

last year, but the IV pulled down a solid win with an

aggressive middle thousand. Brown finished a dis-

tressed second and Northeastern third.

On the headway level, Harvard won for the sec-

ond time in three years. BMW’s rowing crew opened an

early gap on Princeton and Brown and cruised to an

openwater win. For Harvard, the win was a complete

success, as their second boat won earlier in the day by

a similar margin.

It was three straight years that the crew that

won the IV also won the IV, pointed out Morley.

Please turn to page 20

SOME CONSOLOATION Wisconsin’s IV won their race while the varsity could only win the pennant finals.

The Independent Rowing News

48

POCOCK RACING SHELLS

HIGH PERFORMANCE

SUPERIOR CRAFTSMANSHIP

Call (425) 262-6556 or visit us at www.pocock.com

PAID ADVERTISEMENT
Some Reasons Why Otto S. Langum Should be Elected Mayor of Minneapolis.

Otto S. Langum was selected by voters of all parties and in all walks of life, as the man best qualified to administer the affairs of the city government.

Desiring a truly representative city government, the Citizens' Mayorality Committee was organized for the purpose of securing the election of Otto S. Langum.

This committee is non-partisan. Its membership includes working men, business men and professional men, and all are giving support to Otto S. Langum.

WHY?

Because Otto S. Langum's official record has won the approval of the people.

Because he is just, honest and fearless in the performance of his duties.

Because he will administer the affairs of the city in a manner that will make for a better and greater Minneapolis.

Because he is not ruled by a political machine.

Because he has the confidence of the people.

Because he will take to that office every qualification necessary to the proper administration of its affairs.

Because he has been tried and not found wanting.

Because he will be for ALL the people, and

Because Labor Will Get a Square Deal.

These are some of the reasons why Otto S. Langum should be the next Mayor of Minneapolis. There are other reasons, but these are enough to show that you will not be making a mistake by voting for

OTTO S. LANGUM for Mayor of Minneapolis.
“Respondent [shall] cease and desist from creating, producing, selling, or disseminating …
A. Any advertisement that misrepresents, directly or by implication, that it is not a paid advertisement.
B. Any video 15 minutes or longer … that does not display, in a clear and prominent manner and for a length of time sufficient for an ordinary consumer to read, within the first thirty (30) seconds of the commercial or other advertisement and immediately before each presentation of ordering instructions, the following disclosure:

"THE PROGRAM YOU ARE WATCHING IS A PAID ADVERTISEMENT FOR [THE PRODUCT OR SERVICE]."

Search advertising labels (ca. 2002)

“Recommended Sites”
“Featured Listings”
“Premier Listings”
“Search Partners”
“Provided by the ___ Network”

“Start Here”
“Products and Services”
“Partner Search Results”
“Spotlight”

recommendation: “any paid ranking search results [should be] distinguished from non-paid results with clear and conspicuous disclosures”

Heather Hippsley, FTC – Letter to Gary Ruskin – June 27, 2002
User understanding (c.a. 2003-2005)

- Only 47% of users said they could always tell which results are paid. (Pew)
- “Very few participants noticed the label on “sponsored” listings, and only when the label was easy to see.” (Consumer Web Watch)
- Users were surprised to learn that some listings are ads. “Upon enlightenment, his face contorted a bit. He expressed immediate dismay, stating, “Well, that explains it. No wonder I run into so much [expletive].” (CWW)
Recent ad labeling practices: “Sponsored Links” and similar

- Sponsored by who?
  - Search engine
  - Company the user was searching for
  - Company listed in the advertisement
  - Someone else
Recent ad labeling practices:
Advertisement locations

• “Advertisements are on the side, but anything on the left is the best result Google can find.”
Recent ad labeling practices:
Label size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Google</th>
<th>Yahoo</th>
<th>Bing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1: Height of “S” in “Sponsored”</td>
<td>8 pixels</td>
<td>7 pixels</td>
<td>9 pixels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2: Height of a capital letter in ad title</td>
<td>12 pixels</td>
<td>12 pixels</td>
<td>12 pixels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3: Height of a capital letter in search engine’s logo</td>
<td>45 pixels</td>
<td>31 pixels</td>
<td>28 pixels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of 1 to 2</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of 1 to 3</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Experiment

- “Sponsored Links” vs. “Paid Advertisements”
- Online panel of participants

Find three websites that sell twin-size AeroBed® inflatable mattresses and a contact email address for each website.
Findings

• Major effect: Treated users click 25% to 33% fewer advertisements.
• Treated users correctly report that they clicked fewer ads.
Demographic Differences

- Differences are most stark for users with low income, less education, and less online experience

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Treatment</th>
<th>Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No College Degree</td>
<td>1.56</td>
<td>2.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Graduate</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>1.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No online shopping experience</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>3.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online shopping experience</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>1.92</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**advertisements clicked**
Google’s newest advertisement labels

- Clarity
- Size & conspicuousness
- Consistency
- Separation between algorithmic and advertisement listings
Definitions of **ad** on the Web:

- in the Christian era; used before dates after the supposed year Christ was born; “in AD 200”
- a public promotion of some product or service
  [wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn](http://wordnetweb.princeton.edu/perl/webwn)
- Anno Domini (abbreviated as AD or A.D., sometimes found in the irregular form Anno Domine) and Before Christ (abbreviated as BC or B.C.) are designations used to label years in the Julian and Gregorian calendars. ...
- ‘Ād (Arabic ﬁ�) was an ancient Arab tribe and a district in South Arabia that was led by ‘Ad ibn Kin‘ad.
  [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/‘Ād](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/‘Ād)
- .ad is the Internet country code top-level domain (ccTLD) for Andorra. It is administered by Servei de Telecomunicacions d’Andorra.
  [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/ad](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/ad)
- AD was a 1980s Christian rock band, featuring former Kansas members Kerry Livgren and Dave Hope, and former Bloodrock member Warren Ham sharing the lead vocal duties along with Michael Gleason.
- The A Eighth Avenue Express is a rapid transit service of the New York City Subway. It is colored blue on route signs, station signs, and the official subway map, since it runs on the IND Eighth Avenue Line through Manhattan. ...
- A.D. (Anno Domini) is a British/Italian miniseries from 1985 in 6 parts which tells the Acts of the Apostles. ...
- **Short form of advertisement:** To; on
  [en.wiktionary.org/wiki/ad](http://en.wiktionary.org/wiki/ad)
Definitions of **ads** on the Web:

- In mathematics and physics, n-dimensional anti-de Sitter space, sometimes written $\mathbb{AdS}$, is a maximally symmetric Lorentzian manifold with constant negative scalar curvature. ...
  [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/AdS](en.wikipedia.org/wiki/AdS)

- ADS Adelaide is an Australian television station, owned by, and affiliated with the Ten Network.
  [en.wikipedia.org/wiki/ADS_(TV_station)](en.wikipedia.org/wiki/ADS_(TV_station))

- Archaeology Data Service The ADS supports research, learning, and teaching in the area of archaeology with high quality and dependable digital resources. The ADS is based at the University of York and hosts AHDS Archaeology.
  [www.jisc.ac.uk/index.cfm](www.jisc.ac.uk/index.cfm)

- The technologies included in alternate delivery sources are satellite (C-Band), DBS (KU-Band), SMATV (Master Antennae) and MMDS (includes Multi-channel multi-point and multi-point distribution service).
  [www.nielsenmedia.com/glossary/terms/A/index.htm](www.nielsenmedia.com/glossary/terms/A/index.htm)

- Automatic Dependent Surveillance. A data link method of automatically transmitting an aircraft's position, altitude, air speed, and other data. ...

- Active Directory Services
  [www.openca.org/~madwolf/go01.html](www.openca.org/~madwolf/go01.html)

- Automatic debiting systems, EC project aimed at reducing traffic flow on motorways.
  [www.gbc.hu/english/eszotar1.htm](www.gbc.hu/english/eszotar1.htm)

- Advanced Disposal Surcharge

- When a company based overseas wants to sell its shares in the US markets, it can offer them through a US bank, which is known as the depository. ...

- Area Development Society
  [14d.skillsdevelopment.org/footer_navigation/glossary.aspx](14d.skillsdevelopment.org/footer_navigation/glossary.aspx)

- Refers to reception of TV programming via satellite (DBS or large dish).

- Paid notices promoting items available for sale or lease or candidates for office.

- ARM Developer Suite is the name of the 2nd generation of ARM development tools suite from ARM Ltd. ADS provides compilation tools and debugger.
  [arm-development.com/arm_glossary](arm-development.com/arm_glossary)

- means a diving system capable of withstanding external pressures greater than atmospheric pressure, and in which the internal pressure remains at one atmosphere, and includes a one person submarine and a one atmosphere compartment of a diving submersible.
  [www2.worksafebc.ca/Publications/OHSRegulation/Part24.asp](www2.worksafebc.ca/Publications/OHSRegulation/Part24.asp)

- A share issued under deposit agreement that represents an underlying security in the issuer's home country. The terms American depositary receipt (ADR) and American depositary share (ADS) are often thought to mean the same thing. ...

Find definitions of **ads** in:  Chinese (Simplified) Chinese (Traditional)  Czech  Dutch  English  French  German  Italian  Korean  Portuguese  Russian  Slovak  Spanish  all languages
laptop - Google Search

www.google.com/search...  Google

Google  Web  Images  Places  more ▼

laptop

About 181,000,000 results.

Apple® MacBook Pro Laptop Sponsored Links
Fastest, most powerful MacBook Pro with up to 10 hours battery life.
www.apple.com/macbookpro

HP® Laptops
Buy Direct from HP for Our Best Deals on Laptops
Powered by Intel®!
www.shopping.hp.com
(888) 922-9106

LAPTOP Magazine - Product reviews, tech news, buying guides, and more
- 1 hour ago
Nov 9, 2010  LAPTOP Magazine is your
Google search basics: Search results page

The basics

Each blue underlined line is a search result that the Google search engine found for your search terms. The first item is the most relevant match we found, the second is the next most relevant, and so on down the list. If you click the title of any result, you'll be taken to that webpage.

Overview of the search results page

Here's a quick guide to all the elements and tools that you'll find on a Google search results page.

Click these links to learn more:

1. **Header**
2. **Search bar**
3. **Search results**
4. **Tools & filters**
5. **Sponsored links**
6. **Bottom of the page**
References

- Benjamin Edelman and Duncan S. Gilchrist. “‘Sponsored Links’ or ‘Advertisements’?: Measuring Labeling Alternatives in Internet Search Engines.” Mimeo.


www.benedelman.org